

## **Appendix X: Research Literatures Dismissed, by Scholar or Media: Some Examples**

Most scholars (we hope) do not partake in (false) dismissive reviews. If they are unfamiliar with a research literature or haven't done a literature search, they do not claim or suggest otherwise. Some scholars, however, dismiss entire research literatures habitually, which allows them to flit effortlessly from topic to topic, often implying an expertise in each.

Below are partial lists of research literatures dismissed by some prominent education policy scholars, organized by scholar. The lists are culled from the collection of over a thousand dismissive reviews posted in the online resource, *Dismissive Reviews and Citation Cartels in US Education Policy Research—A List*.<sup>1</sup>

Each entry in the lists below represents a dismissed research literature. The scholar in the heading claimed that no previous research had been conducted on the listed topic (or none that was worth considering, anyway).

### **Regime 1: The Education Establishment Citation Cartel**

Daniel M. Koretz, Harvard University and CRESST

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Test score inflation

Test score-based accountability

Evaluations of test score-based accountability programs

Benefits of testing

Postsecondary characteristics and effects of testing

Effects of test preparation, test coaching

Test score inflation with disadvantaged children

Test scores' limitations for evaluating programs, schools, or educators

Existence of test score inflation

Calculating value-added estimates with low-stakes tests

High quality evaluations of test-based reforms

Improvements in achievement gaps

Comparing college predictive validities of high school GPAs and tests

College predictive validity of end-of-course tests

College predictive validity of high school summative tests  
Test coaching studies using randomly equivalent groups  
Motivational effects of high stakes tests  
Empirical research on effects of high stakes testing  
Experimental studies of score inflation  
Embedding less predictable items in tests  
Effects of testing and behavioral responses to testing  
Test linking with high stakes tests  
Studies linking specific behaviors to score inflation  
Studies evaluating changes when one high stakes test replaces another  
Effect of accountability tests on student achievement  
Characteristics of tests that impede or facilitate score inflation  
Effect of accountability programs on student achievement and school effectiveness  
Varying effects of different approaches to accountability  
Comparing effects of various ways of setting targets  
Effects of including students with disabilities in testing programs  
Relative advantages of reporting test results disaggregated by groups  
Effects of subjective measures in accountability  
The use of test score data  
Public's understanding of tests and score data  
Testing-related research in general in public schools  
Educators' understanding of testing and test data  
Policymakers' understanding of testing and test data  
Stakeholders' interpretation of standards-based data  
Variations in educators' response to test data  
Positive effects from test-based accountability  
Drawing from other fields with accountability systems  
Data about student performance at the end of high school  
Comparative studies of large-scale assessments  
The consequences of testing  
Teachers' and principals' responses to testing  
Systematic data about cheating  
Testing regimens that preceded No Child Left Behind  
Testing's effects on practice beyond just overall averages  
Comprehensive source of information on time devoted to coaching activities  
Comprehensive studies of frequency of cheating  
The range of test coaching strategies and their effects  
The effects of published report cards on parental decision making or on schools  
Data on affirmative action

Effect of affirmative action admissions  
Methods for evaluating validity of score gains with high stakes tests  
Changes in school grading standards over time  
Empirical evidence about grade inflation  
Grade inflation over time in secondary schools  
Generalizability of gains in scores on high stakes tests  
Effects of test format differences on students with disabilities  
Approaches to measure long-term trends  
Evaluations of 1980s school reforms  
Instructional effects of performance assessments

## **Regime 2: The Education Reform Citation Cartel**

Martin R. West, Harvard University

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Class size effects  
Effect of class size on student outcomes internationally  
School district size effects  
School size effects  
Voucher effects  
Inclusion of private schools in school choice studies  
Participation in voucher programs  
No Child Left Behind effect on school choice  
No Child Left Behind effect on curricular choice  
Effects of mayoral control of schools  
Teacher collective bargaining effects  
Evidence of different compensation schemes, working conditions, or terms of service in states that prohibit bargaining  
Non-cognitive skills  
Non-cognitive effects on lifetime outcomes  
How policy affects non-cognitive skills  
Effect of class size on student non-cognitive outcomes  
Cost-effectiveness of class-size reductions  
Relationship between money spent on education services and school performance  
Relationship between money spent on education services and school district performance  
Effect of school choice on school autonomy  
How teachers respond to performance incentives  
Relationship between teacher mobility, attrition, and effectiveness  
Relationship between teacher job transitions and effectiveness  
Principal effects on student achievement

Influence of principal recognition of teacher effectiveness on personnel decisions  
Effects of alternative grade configurations in middle and high grades  
International comparisons on effects of alternative grade configurations  
Effects of online courses on student achievement in K-12  
Effects of virtual education  
Comparison of parent perceptions of school life across charter, private, public schools  
Parent satisfaction with children's schools in charter, private, public  
Parent perceptions of charter schools

Frederick M. Hess, American Enterprise Institute

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...  
Large-scale research on school reform  
How innovation affects policymaking  
How public schools respond to competition  
How often teachers are sanctioned  
Relationship between leadership preparation and school success  
Foundations courses and teacher effectiveness  
Examination of school district politics and elections  
Political competition at the school district level  
Factors that determine the election of mayors  
What school boards do  
Accountability policies  
Mayoral takeover effects  
Effect of school board appointments vs. elections  
District personnel policy changes after right-to-work laws  
Arbitration in education labor negotiations  
Collective bargaining effects on education  
Educational leadership  
Content of principal preparation programs

Brian A. Jacob, University of Michigan

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...  
Testing policy and dropout rates  
Graduation exams and student achievement  
Minimum competency testing and student achievement  
School-based accountability studies with individual student data  
Effects of high-stakes testing  
Effects of testing  
Existence of high-stakes testing before the 1990s

Existence of city-wide high-stakes testing programs before the 1990s

Achievement effects of grade promotion testing

Impact of public housing or housing vouchers on education

Educators cheating on tests

Factors that predict cheating on tests

Effect of remediation programs

Relationship between self-efficacy and student learning

Correlation of teacher value-added and principal evaluations

Factors education employers consider when hiring or firing

How principals hire and fire teachers

Effect of employment protection on teacher effort

Effect of school accountability policies on other practices

Relationship between school accountability and spending

Relationship between hiring factors and subsequent teacher performance

Test score manipulation by educators

Effect of test score manipulation on student outcomes

Factors that lead educators to cheat on student tests

#### Matthew M. Chingos, Urban Institute

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Teacher responses to performance incentives

Relationship between teacher mobility, attrition, and quality

Correlation of citizen perceptions and government service quality

Citizen perception of public schools and student achievement

How informed parents and public are about local school performance

Effect of individual teachers on student achievement

Downward effects of teacher experience on performance

Studies comparing teacher performance before and after advanced degree

Effectiveness of university teacher preparation programs

Effects of on-the-job training over teaching life cycle

Effects of large-scale class-size reduction policies

Relationship between teacher effectiveness and job transitions

Evidence from a statewide database on correlates of entry into school leadership positions

Principals' effects on student achievement

Influence of administrator's ability to recognize teacher effectiveness on their personnel decisions

Information on instructional materials in use

Studies linking student achievement data to instructional materials used

Evidence on effectiveness of instructional materials in use  
Information on which materials are used in which schools  
Estimates of testing and assessment system costs  
Long term impacts of a private-school voucher award to low-income student  
Costs of online instruction and effectiveness  
Studies of hybrid instruction effectiveness  
Studies comparing online, face-to-face, and hybrid learning  
Online learning studies of minimally acceptable quality  
Studies of online learning for large introductory courses  
Rigorous evidence of learning outcomes from online learning  
Long-term impacts of K-12 interventions  
Long-term impacts of private school vouchers  
How well students learn in college courses  
Studies of the structure of teacher retirement benefits  
High quality research of impact of fully online courses  
Data on instructional products used in most states  
Studies of curriculum effectiveness  
Evidence on student loan debt  
Studies of school superintendents' effects on student achievement  
Effects of school district reform on student achievement  
Relation of state NAEP performance to demographic changes  
Distributional consequences of making college free  
Studies of private, non-profit colleges  
Studies of the inequality of school availability in school choice schemes  
Impact of private school choice program on college enrollment and degree attainment  
What matters for college completion  
Relationship of college readiness programs and college graduation

Eric A. Hanushek, Stanford University

There is no previous research (or any that is any good) on ...

Trends in socioeconomic achievement gaps  
Long run trends in achievement gaps  
Studies of test-based accountability and effects of testing  
Accountability systems other than those of No Child Left Behind  
Role of teacher quality in explaining differences in student performance  
Comparative international studies of teacher quality effects  
Quantify differences in teacher skills in numeracy and literacy  
Evidence on the return to (i.e., earning advantage of) skills in the labor market  
Studies following tested students into the labor market

Studies of academic achievement effects in the labor market (a 2001 study is labeled an "early" study)  
 Studies of the effect of principal quality  
 Systematic studies of principals' impact on student outcomes  
 Evidence of teacher quality impact on students with disabilities  
 Evidence on how to structure teacher incentives  
 Evidence on effect of accountability on student outcomes  
 Any school accountability programs prior to the 1980s  
 Effect of gaming accountability systems  
 How accountability systems work  
 Research on outcomes of accountability systems  
 Explicit descriptions of policies, regulations, and incentives that determine student performance  
 Experience in the design and operation of accountability systems  
 How to accumulate knowledge or ways schools can improve  
 Collateral impact of accountability on efficiency of resource usage  
 What helps students learn  
 Research that concentrates on student performance  
 How to improve student performance  
 Experience implementing accountability systems based on outcomes  
 Educational evaluation in general ("evaluation is seldom an integral part of schools today")

### **Regime 3. The Permanent Education Press**

#### *Chalkbeat*

Access to gifted programs by SES with national data (2019)  
 "Credible" national studies of effects of charter schools on racial integration (2019)  
 Studies of Common Core's effect on learning (2019)  
 "Clear" benefits of high school exit exams (2019)  
 Randomized trials of restorative justice in schools (2019)  
 Effectiveness of new teachers after teaching under supervision (2018)  
 Student test anxiety (2018)  
 Effect of familiarity with other students on student attendance (2018)  
 Effect on students of mid-year departures of teachers (2018)  
 Suspensions causing poor test scores and graduation rates (2018)  
 Effect on student teachers learning from especially effective teachers (2018)  
 Effect of rate of suspensions on classroom order (2018)  
 Research on test prep (2018)  
 Frequency of teacher migration compared to other professions (2017)

Rigorous studies of school vouchers (just one in Florida) (2017)

Hechinger Report

Nationwide racial and ethnic breakdown of career education (2021)  
Nationwide study of disparities in CTE by race or ethnicity (2021)  
National database of academic performance (2021)  
Studies on effects of test prep or coaching (2020)  
Studies on test score inflation (“willfully ignored”) (2020)  
Quality research on the effects of retention in grade (2014)

The 74

Research on tax credit programs (2017)  
Effects of restricting suspensions (2017)  
Comparative effects on learning of different curricula and textbooks (2017)  
Effects of teacher diversity (2017)  
Are teachers “burning out” from testing and evaluation policies? (2016)  
Positive outcomes of exit exams (2016)  
Evidence of exit exams improving achievement or wages (2016)  
Discussion of exit exams’ stakes for students (2016)  
Causes and consequences of test-score manipulation (2016)

---

<sup>1</sup> Phelps, R. P. (2016+). Dismissive Reviews and Citation Cartels in US Education Policy Research—A List, *Nonpartisan Education Review/Resources*.  
<https://nonpartisaneducation.org/Review/Resources/DismissiveList.htm>